



202

40 High House Drive  
Lickey  
Birmingham  
B45 8ET  
U.K.

September 21, 2007

Commissioner for Patents  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria  
Virginia 22313-1450

For the Attention of Kathleen A. McNelis  
Art Unit 1742

Dear Ms McNelis

Application No. 10/521,306 ✓

Hansmann et al. (U.S. P.G. Pub. 2001/0045142) does not disclose a method for reducing solid metal oxide material incorporating multiple closed loops of recirculating molten metal, the essence of my claims 1 – 15. The applicant fails to see any connection whatsoever between these claims and the teachings of Hansmann et al. and thus does not accept the Examiner's statements in this regard and rejects that the features described in independent claim 1 are known in the art and thus do not introduce an inventive concept.

I find the language relating to election with or without traverse totally incomprehensible. However, to ensure that my election is unambiguous, I categorically state that claims 1 – 15 remain the substance of my invention and given the opportunity to defend specific issues contained therein, which the Examiner finds objectionable, I most certainly would wish discussion to continue and therefore now withdraw claim 17 from the Patent Application, but leave claims 1 – 15 in place.

Your letter was delivered to my home address in the U.K. precisely a week ago but, because of a visit from my daughter and her family now resident in Australia and other commitments, I have not had the opportunity to respond until now.

Yours sincerely

Noel A Warner  
Emeritus Professor